

Philippine Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
88TH MULTI-STAKEHOLDER GROUP MEETING
16 February 2024, Friday | 9:00 AM - 12:00 NN | Hybrid Meeting
Department of Finance, Manila, and Google Meet

Attendees:

GOVERNMENT	
1. USec. Bayani H. Agabin	Department of Finance (DOF)
2. ASec. Karlo Fermin S. Adriano	DOF
3. ASec. Juabilly Racho	Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG)
4. Mr. Jedd John Castillo	DILG
5. Ms. Anna Victoria Quibot	DILG
6. Dir. Ma. Pamela Quizon	Bureau of Local Government Finance (BLGF)
7. Engr. Romualdo Aguilos	Mines and Geoscience Bureau (MGB)
8. Mr. Augustus Cesar A. Navarro	Department of Energy (DOE)
9. Mr. Andres Jr. Pangilinan	DOE
10. Mr. Dan Emmanuel Montealegro	DOE
11. Ms. Maricor Anne Cauton	Union of Local Authorities of the Philippines (ULAP)

INDUSTRY

1. Atty. Ronald Rex S. Recidoro	Chamber of Mines of the Philippines
2. Atty. Francis Ballesteros	PHILEX Mining
3. Atty. Kiril Caral	Petroleum Association of the Philippines, Shell Philippines Exploration

CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS

1. Ms. Beverly Besmanos	Bantay Kita
2. Mr. Chito Trillanes	Social Action Center—Ecology Desk, Diocese of Tandag, Surigao del Sur
3. Prof. Ladylyn L. Mangada	UP Visayas Tacloban
4. Ms. Aniceta Baltazar	Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Governance
5. Ms. Jeanira Godio-Okubo	PILIPINA, Baguio-Benguet Chapter, Alternate Member, PH-EITI
6. Mr. Rodne Galicha	LIVING LAUDATO SI' PHILIPPINES, Alternate Member

CONSULTANT

1. Mr. Marco Zaplan	Bantay Kita
---------------------	-------------

PH- EITI Secretariat

1. Mary Ann D. Rodolfo
2. Mary Nicole M. Hilario

3. Albert A. San Diego
4. Rhea B. Pamatmat
5. Rhoda H. Aranco
6. Amiel De Guzman
7. Job G. Besmonte
8. Andrea Denise B. Samson
9. Mark Ernest Famatigan
10. Aliyah Mae Gozon
11. Ricardo C. Evora

Agenda

I. Call to Order	5
II. Approval of the meeting agenda	5
III. Minutes of the 87th MSG Meeting	5
IV. Matters arising from the previous meetings	6
V. Main Business	11
1. 9th PH-EITI Report (FY 2021): Addressing the gaps (Reconciliation Report)	11
2. Targeted Assessment Stakeholder Consultation Schedule	12
3. ETW 2023 Highlights	12
4. National Secretariat Updates	13
<i>a. Organizational Structure and Functions</i>	13
<i>b. Financial Report for 2023</i>	13
<i>c. GAA FY 2024</i>	13

5. PH-EITI Forward: Draft 2024 Work Plan	13
6. Presentation of Civic Space Report	14
VI. Other matters	16
<i>2024 MSG Retreat and Capacity Building Workshop and Validation Stakeholder Consultations (March 18-21, 2024)</i>	16
VII. Summary of agreements	17
VIII. Adjournment	18

Proceedings

I. Call to order

DOF Undersecretary Bayani H. Agabin chaired the meeting. As there were only two representatives from the industry sector, the chair asked the representatives in attendance if they could waive the quorum and proceed with the meeting. They agreed and the meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. Approval of the meeting agenda

The Chair sought the approval of the agenda

An industry representative moved for the approval of the agenda. The motion was seconded, and the agenda was approved.

III. Minutes of the 87th MSG Meeting

The Chair gave the members 5 working days to peruse the minutes of the 87th meeting and to submit any comments or corrections, if any. If no comments are received, the minutes will be deemed approved.

IV. Matters Arising from Previous Meeting

The Secretariat discussed the matters arising from the previous 87th MSG Meeting held on November 28, 2023, and from the Special MSG Meeting held on December 27, 2023.

ITEM	ACTION	IN-CHARGE	STATUS
Beneficial Ownership	The MSG referred the discussion on privacy concerns and appropriate mechanisms on Beneficial Ownership to the Implementation Committee. As an initial step, the MSG may consider looking for red flags or trigger indicators.	MSG	Ongoing
Civic Engagement	BK agreed to amend the clauses and provide another presentation for the MSG to further discuss the “by invitation” mode of nomination and other guidelines in the selection of CSO representatives to the MMT and MRFC.	BK, MSG	Not yet started
Civil Engagement	BK commits to provide assistance in terms of capacity-building and documentary requirements for CSOs who intend to be accredited by the LGUs and other government agencies.	BK	Not yet started
FY 2021 Report	The Secretariat to set and follow up on the weekly milestones with the Independent Administrator (IA) to ensure that progress is made in the Data Reconciliation chapter of the FY 2021 Country Report.	Secretariat	Completed

FY 2021 Report	The Secretariat to include the following items in the FY 2021 Report: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • differentiation of volume from value of extractive commodities in data presentations; • quotes from key stakeholders to further humanize the report; and • analysis that compares the effective tax rate per year. 	Secretariat	Completed
	The Secretariat to include discussions on just energy transition in FY 2022 Country Report and succeeding reports.	Secretariat, IA	Not yet started
MSG Governance	The Secretariat to assist all MSG committee representatives in their respective reports.	Secretariat	Ongoing
	The MSG to review the membership of each committee, especially the GOC. The GOC is supposed to address the concerns, decisions, and complaints of other committees.	MSG	Completed
	The Secretariat to coordinate with BK in submitting letters to MGB in relation to concerns received through the feedback mechanism.	Secretariat, BK	Not yet started
MSG Governance	The GOC to discuss and decide the maximum number of days in processing the cases in the feedback mechanism.	GOC	Ongoing

SET-UP-GO	The Secretariat to coordinate with the respective Economic/Regional Development Councils of Dinagat Island and Palawan regarding the pilot program for subnationalization and inclusion of an EITI committee in the RDC, among other matters.	Secretariat	Not yet started
Strategic Studies	The Secretariat to conduct a science-based investigation on the complaint from the Municipality of Loreto to further identify the specific minerals and trace the processing plants that caused the siltation.	Secretariat	Not yet started
	Next year (2024), the Secretariat is tasked to conduct a scoping study and produce a thematic paper on downstream processing particularly on the variability of nickel processing plants and how can it be reconciled with small-scale nickel plants.	Secretariat	Not yet started
Stakeholder engagement	The MSG recommended adding more activities at the local level in the 2024 action plan, as well as engaging with NCIP.		Ongoing
	The Secretariat to furnish capacity development initiatives for stakeholders pertaining to data reporting, to be incorporated into the 2024 work plan.		Ongoing

FY 2021 Report	The MSG initially approved the Reconciliation Chapter of the FY2021 report, and the Secretariat will incorporate the MSG's comments into the chapter.		Completed
FY 2021 Report	The MSG approved the highlights of the Contextual Information Chapter of the FY2021 report, and the Secretariat will incorporate the MSG's comments into the chapter.		Completed
	The MSG approved the Civic Space Chapter of the FY2021 report and recommended including a section indicating that additional reports on civic space are anticipated for publication next year. The MSG advised reconciling forthcoming reports from the consultant and from Bantay Kita.		Completed
	The MSG recommended engaging with the EITI International Secretariat to ensure that PH-EITI's plans are in compliance with the requirements for the forthcoming Validation.		Completed
FY 2021 Report	The MSG committed to provide assistance to the Independent Administrator in gathering supporting documents which will improve the substantiveness of the Data Reconciliation.	MSG, IA	Completed
MSG Governance	The MSG to review and revise the resolution by the GOC on	MSG, Secretariat	Ongoing

	the pilot program for feedback mechanism.		
	The Secretariat to disseminate the minutes and highlights of the MSG meetings.	Secretariat	Ongoing
FY 2021 Report	The MSG recommended adding a section to the civic space chapter that assesses red tagging incidents, addressing the related concerns raised by the EITI IS, pending MSG approval.		Completed
	The MSG approved the highlights of the Civic Space Chapter of the FY2021 report, and the Secretariat will incorporate the MSG's comments into the chapter. 1. Submit a comprehensive report in January 2024 2. Include a brief description Bantay Kita's report in the civic space chapter		Completed
FY 2021 Report	Bantay Kita to circulate their civic space report to the MSG prior to submission to the EITI IS.		Completed
MSG Governance	The Secretariat to circulate to the MSG the process for targeted assessment.		Completed
	The Secretariat will organize an MSG meeting in preparation for the Validation.		Completed

 88th MSG meeting masterslide

The Chair asked for questions and comments on the matters arising from the previous meeting.

A civil society representative asked the Secretariat for clarification regarding the number of days required for processing cases submitted through Feedback Mechanism.

The Secretariat noted that initially, the processing of feedback in the flowchart took 57 days, following Alternate Chair's directive to align with ARTA's procedures. However, during the 87th MSG meeting, there was a suggestion to streamline the process. The Secretariat proposed that in the upcoming Governance and Oversight Committee (GOC) meeting, they will present a comprehensive flowchart detailing how to handle received feedback. The Secretariat also shared that the GOC also agreed that at each meeting, the Secretariat would provide updates on the status of the feedback received.

The Chair proposed that when the Secretariat receives a complaint requiring information from another agency, PH-EITI should promptly issue a request letter to the relevant agency for the needed information and wait for one week for their reply, then follow up accordingly. The Secretariat was instructed to discuss with the committee and determine what is considered acceptable, then update the MSG on the status of the matters arising.

V. MAIN BUSINESS

1. 9th PH-EITI Report (FY 2021): Addressing the gaps (Reconciliation Report)

The Secretariat discussed updates on the production of the FY 2021 Country Report, including a timeline Overview for context.

They shared that from December 20, 2023, to December 26, 2023, there had been a back-and-forth communication between the IA and the Secretariat regarding the reconciliation datasheet initially submitted on the 20th due to identified gaps based on Secretariat review. Examples of these gaps are:

- Inconsistent tagging of participating companies
- Missing Table 8 (Fiscal incentives availed by participating companies)
- Missing DOE data in the reconciliation, resulting in a high variance of -6.03%; ending variance presented was -3.74%.
- Inconsistent formula used for calculation

- Requested clarification on the formula used for the reconciliation variance

On December 25, 2023, the Secretariat received the Narrative and recommendations write-up (without tables) from the IA, followed by a Special MSG meeting on December 27, 2023. Subsequently, on December 28, 2023, the Secretariat finalized the contextual information chapter and civic engagement chapter based on MSG comments from the meeting. On December 29, 2023, the Secretariat reviewed, edited, and formatted the write-up submitted by the IA, including inserting tables from the reconciliation datasheet, thus compiling the full 9th Country Report. Finally, on December 30, 2023, the PH-EITI 9th Country Report was published, and in January 2024, the Secretariat commenced work on the FY 2021 summary data file. However, upon consulting the reconciliation report, some inconsistencies in the presented data were noted.

With this, the Secretariat shared that they met with the IA to discuss the identified gaps and agreed to two main submissions from the IA. These are: first, to complete the dataset disaggregated at the highest level, preferably in long format (to be used as the only source file for all tables) by February 16, 2024; and second, to provide a revised reconciliation datasheet (with all the individual tables and a description of the data analysis/reconciliation process) by February 29, 2024.

The Secretariat shared the ongoing review of the FY 2021 PH-EITI Country Report, including some samples of the identified gaps. They mentioned that they have already communicated with the EITI International Secretariat that PH-EITI's plans to revise the report due to the gaps found.

The MSG showed concern about the variance of the data. The Chair added that it should be the responsibility of the Independent Administrator (IA).

A civil society representative voiced concerns regarding the identified gaps. She inquired about potential improvements and efficiency enhancements, suggesting the possibility of engaging an IA at an earlier stage or enhancing the Secretariat's oversight to prevent such issues in the future. Additionally, she highlighted concerns about data integrity and emphasized the importance of close

supervision. She requested the implementation of a tracking mechanism by the Secretariat to closely monitor and guide the IA.

The Chair said that there are (3) three things to consider in addressing the gap with the IA, which include time, money, and experience. Time is a factor because we started late due to issues with BIR waivers. Money is another consideration, as there isn't enough budget to hire more experienced accounting firms. Additionally, experience, which is closely tied to budget constraints, was highlighted. The Chair suggested that hiring enough people with expertise could lead to the production of more effective reports.

The Chair instructed the Secretariat to provide updates on the draft report to the Implementation Committee in the first week of March. Once the data are reconciled, the draft report should be submitted at the committee level and then discussed at the MSG level.

An industry representative asked how these discrepancies will impact the validation. The secretariat clarified that validation will focus solely on Requirement 1.3, which pertains to civil society engagement.

2. Targeted Assessment Stakeholder Consultation Schedule

The Secretariat provided the following updates on the ongoing Targeted Assessment of PH-EITI:

- On December 30, PH-EITI submitted both Self-Assessment and Targeted Assessment templates for Requirement 1.3 to EITI International:
- On December 31, the Secretariat uploaded the Dossier to the PH-EITI website.
- The PH-EITI Secretariat, with the assistance of the Civil Society Engagement Consultant, prepared a stakeholder list, from which the Validation team will select individuals for validation interviews.
- Consultations with various agencies and stakeholders, including DILG and NTF-ELCAC, are underway and tentatively scheduled for February 2024.

- The tentative date for the EITI IS mission will be on March 18 onwards.

The Secretariat also shared the meetings conducted related to the targeted assessment.

The Chair noted the schedule of the Secretariat's presentation and asked to keep them updated.

3. ETW 2023 Highlights

The Secretariat shared the ETW 2023 Highlights. On the first day, the 87th Meeting was conducted, along with the Pre-Validation Workshop facilitated by the PH-EITI IS. On the second day of the ETW, the Constituencies Meeting took place, featuring a series of conversations entitled "Mines and Refined". The second day also included the PH-EITI Gala Night, where extractive stakeholders were recognized for their continuous participation in the EITI process in the country. On the last day of the ETW, the FORGE PH: 2023 PH-EITI National Conference was held. The Secretariat also presented the number of participants per event.

Moreover, the Secretariat presented to the MSG some of the issues, feedback, and concerns raised during the ETW. Overall, assessments from the participants are satisfactory, including the venue or platform, structure, speakers, and quality of discussion. Additionally, the financial report was also presented.

A civil society representative congratulated the Secretariat for the success of the ETW. She said that the way it was conducted was beyond what they expected. The Chair also agreed and hoped to have this kind of event again.

4. National Secretariat Updates

The Secretariat presented the updates on staff composition, including the restructuring of units. The Data Management and Reporting Unit will be responsible for managing PH-EITI data, including tasks such as collecting,

processing, validating, storing, and publishing data. Additionally, overseeing the technical requirements of the Secretariat, including report production, research, and policy reforms.

The Stakeholder Management and Outreach Unit will be responsible for overseeing and executing stakeholder engagement activities, which entail managing communication, facilitating consultations and meetings, and implementing outreach strategies. These efforts are aimed at ensuring effective collaboration and understanding among stakeholders.

The Communications and Knowledge Management Unit will be responsible for strategizing and implementing communication plans and managing knowledge resources to enhance awareness, understanding, and accessibility of information regarding the transparency and accountability of the extractive industries.

The Secretariat also presented the Financial Report for GAA FY 2023 (GAA), which had a total budget of 12,030,276.57, with 10,869,307.07 already obligated, leaving a balance of 1,160,969.50 available for use in 2024. Additionally, the GAA FY 2024 has a total budget of 17,701,000.00.

The Chair voiced out that the budget is being increased so that hopefully it can also give a huge boost to the activities of the PH-EITI.

The Chair shared the concern about the institutionalization of PH-EITI, which is set to be discussed in a meeting with NEDA. The Chair brought up that although PH-EITI is already going on ten years, the staff are still on contractual employment with no security of tenure.

The Chair acknowledged the National Secretariat Updates and emphasized the importance of clear channels for the MSG to address their needs.

5. 2024 PH-EITI Work Plan

The Secretariat presented the draft 2024 work plan of the PH-EITI. Four strategic objectives, which were adopted from the 2023 work plan, were discussed.

Additionally, discussions covered aspects such as outcomes, responsible parties, timelines, costs, and funding.

The first strategic objective is to Strengthen Institutions and Linkages that includes Gender Inclusivity, EITI Institutionalization, and Subnationalization.

The second strategic objective focuses on mainstreaming disclosure. The Secretariat discussed that PH-EITI will continue to engage both extractive companies and relevant government agencies to publish information useful for research, policymaking, informing public debate, and monitoring the benefits people receive from extractive activities. Activities under this objective include streamlining the PH-EITI reporting process and mechanism, producing the FY 2022 PH-EITI Report in 2024, exploring and assessing Small-Scale Mining (SSM) data for PH-EITI reporting, utilizing the EITI Platform for climate action and energy transition, promoting and encouraging the meaningful utilization of PH-EITI data to a broad spectrum of stakeholders through targeted regional data use workshops, and enhancing the PH-EITI Database and Data Tools through mainstreaming and the development of data portals.

The third strategic objective is on enhancing stakeholder capacity. Under this, the PH-EITI will focus on ensuring that stakeholders will have the capacity to use data as well as have sufficient and functioning spaces for the discussion and analysis of extractive information. The initiative will also cover the development of competencies and the enhancement of resources to improve stakeholder participation. Activities under this objective include MSG governance, MSG capacity building, community outreach, regional roadshows, subnationalization, dialogue and consultation with stakeholders, requirement 1.3 targeted assessment, social media content management, online community management, and website management.

The fourth strategic objective focuses on monitoring progress, with PH-EITI giving utmost importance to measuring the outcomes and impacts of all initiatives through the establishment of a monitoring and evaluation mechanism. Activities under this objective include monitoring and documentation, EITI implementation,

media coverage and partnership development, and dissemination of monitoring reports.

After discussing the PH-EITI 2024 Work Plan, the Secretariat shared the calendar of activities for the year 2024.

A civil society representative raised three key points. Firstly, they observed that the work plan is quite extensive, suggesting it should be streamlined to focus on achievable goals within a year. Secondly, they suggested that regional roadshows could be utilized to gather input from the region regarding their preferences for the subnationalization of PH-EITI, ensuring it extends beyond mere conceptualization for BARMM and SSM. They also noted the potential for discussions to encompass topics beyond PH-EITI, such as sand and gravel extraction or water management, to address specific concerns in each area. Lastly, they stressed the importance of PH-EITI addressing the situation in Maco, Davao De Oro, where APEX Mining is located, and how the PH-EITI should treat this kind of incident.

The secretariat acknowledged the initial two points raised by the civil society representative and intends to streamline the work plan based on prioritization and feasibility. Regarding subnationalization, they informed that a detailed work plan is currently in progress. Once completed, they will present it at the committee level for further discussion.

A government representative updated the other members on the data collection for year 2022 and 2023, mentioning that the data for year 2023 has not been updated yet and will be available in the third quarter of the year.

The Chair asked about the government's position on the Maco Incident. The government representative responded that they are currently in the process of drafting their position paper and declined to comment further on the issue.

A civil society representative raised that the PH-EITI could somehow help investigate what happened, saying that this is the spirit of subnationalization.

Someone needs to go down and inquire about what happened to consolidate the data and then put out recommendations.

The Chair stated that there may already be ongoing investigations, and PH-EITI can consolidate existing data. They added that the MGB possesses the necessary technical expertise and data resources. Given that Congress is already conducting an investigation, it would be wise to avoid duplicating efforts. Instead, PH-EITI can provide them with relevant data, such as royalties or SDMP information in that area, to inform policies that can aid in the investigation.

A civil society representative suggested that CSOs in the area can help. The Chair mentioned the mechanism that CSOs can use to report any information that PH-EITI can relay to the relevant agencies.

A civil society representative proposed that CSOs in the region could offer assistance. The Chair mentioned the feedback mechanism through which CSOs could report any information, which PH-EITI could then communicate to the appropriate agencies.

Another civil society representative commented on the work plan presented, stating that subnationalization is not only about increasing awareness but also about immersing and working with local government units. She also added that goals and objectives need to be clear so that our activities can effectively target and address the issues of the community. While it is good to prioritize BARMM, the same representative suggested including Dinagat Islands in Surigao. Regarding the incident in Maco, the civil society representative suggested that the MSG release a statement to demand accountability regarding the implementation of laws by the LGU and the activities of mining companies.

The Chair proposed that the inputs regarding the subnationalization from civil society representatives be discussed at the committee level. Additionally, the Chair inquired about the body's stance on issuing a statement regarding the Maco Incident. The board agreed. The Secretariat was instructed to draft a statement calling for a comprehensive investigation and accountability to prevent similar

incidents from occurring in the future. The statement will then be circulated for approval by the MSG.

A civil society representative also proposed reviewing the operational manuals of the MRFC and MMT to examine the composition of their members and enhance the committees' performance. They emphasized that ensuring the effective implementation of the plans overseen by these committees can help prevent such incidents in the future.

The Chair suggested streamlining and prioritizing activities outlined in the Work Plan. The MSG approved the work plan in principle, subject to changes. The Secretariat will apply the comments and suggestions of the MSG and will recirculate the work plan to the MSG once it is done.

6. Presentation of Civic Space Report

The Bantay Kita consultant provided a brief overview of the key points in the Civic Space Report 2023, titled "Breaking Barriers, Empowering Communities," by Bantay Kita. He also acknowledged the constructive comments from PH-EITI Secretariat and MSG members, especially CSO members to finalize the report. The consultant outlined the study's objectives, framework, methodology, and findings, which are divided into two main sections: Corrective Actions and Civic Space Assessment. Lastly, they presented conclusions and recommendations for stakeholders.

He mentioned that the general objective of the study is to assess civic space in natural resource governance in the Philippines, accompanied by specific objectives. The framework utilized to gauge civic space in this report is based on the guidelines established by the Transparency and Accountability Initiative (TAI). Additionally, he explained that they employed both qualitative and quantitative methodology.

According to the corrective actions assessment by the CSO-MSG members, the overall sentiment from the findings indicates that there has been progress in

addressing the corrective measures, and the EITI process has provided a platform for CSOs to engage with the government and industries, especially at the national level. However, they also acknowledge that more needs to be done.

Here are some of the key findings:

- PH-EITI serves as a platform for constructive engagement in natural resources governance (NG), offering remedies for the protection of civil society actors' freedom of expression.
- CSOs face challenges and insecurity, particularly with red tagging, hindering their ability to dissent or expose violations within the natural resource governance.
- Barriers exist for local COs and mining-affected communities to access and participate in the EITI process, highlighting the importance of capacity-building and subnationalization.
- Government measures for addressing NRG-related human rights violations are acknowledged, yet full implementation is pending, stressing the importance of ensuring civil society's rights are not violated during implementation.

Conclusion:

- The EITI process has helped create spaces for engagement at the national level; there is still a need for more concrete plans and actions to address the EITI Board's corrective actions
- There are open spaces and enabling factors in terms of assembly, citizen participation, and access to information
- Some limitations and barriers still exist including meaningful representation of sectors and full implementation of existing laws and regulations in natural resource governance

Recommendations:

Government

- Strengthen civil society participation policies
- Institutionalize local platforms for SO engagement
- Institutionalize safety and rapid response measures for afflicted CSOs
- Providing technical and financial support to SOs

Industry

- Promote Collaboration with CSOs
- Adopt a comprehensive human rights framework
- Enhance financial transparency

Civil Society

- Strengthen networks and collaborations
- Lobby for policies that institutionalize civil society participation
- Build capacity and promote inclusivity
- Monitor and document Violations, promote evidence-based advocacy

EITI Board

- Continue dialogues and provide technical assistance
- Monitor the implementation of corrective actions more frequently
- Promote sub-nationalization of the EITI process

The Alternate Chair asked for a table summarizing the comments, indicating whether they were addressed, and providing details of any revisions made. This would enable them to compare whether the comments from the initial report were incorporated into the final version. The consultant agreed to this request.

Bantay Kita mentioned that the Shadow Report in 2021 and the Civic Space Report 2023 were conducted using different methodologies, funding, and strategies. They expressed their desire to emphasize in the current study that CSOs encompass not only large local NGOs but also numerous people's organizations with their own unique issues that may not have been reached out to. They aim for a more inclusive approach in this report, ensuring representation from all provinces with mining companies, not just those organizations with higher budgets.

The Chair welcomed the opportunity to discuss and suggested that the report of the Bantay Kita and the PH-EITI both had a civic space, maybe it can be as one.

The Chair also asked Bantay Kita for its overall assessment of the corrective actions that could impact the ongoing targeted assessment.

A civil society representative expressed concern about the result of the study, indicating that there is no consensus within the civil society constituency regarding the corrective action assessment. The Chair said that such disagreements somehow show the vibrancy of the debate within the MSG and PH-EITI. A civil society representative also expressed that the self-assessment template provided by the EITI international is confusing. Suggested having a template with specific criteria.

An industry representative voiced concerns about the first shadow report, suggesting that the EITI IS may seek a status report regarding these allegations. If we can inform them that the situation has changed dramatically and the environment described in the shadow report is no longer prevalent, the recommendations become irrelevant.

The Alternate Chair raised questions on the methodology used in the research of Bantay Kita.

The Bantay Kita consultant elaborated on the methodology employed in their study.

Bantay Kita expressed gratitude to the MSG for the information and recommendations, stating that they will take the comments into consideration to improve their study. They also added that Bantay Kita views the study results as a challenge and an opportunity to enhance their strategies moving forward.

Civil Society representatives highlighted the challenge of reaching consensus due to varying exposures and perceptions among CSO-MSG members, as well as the diverse realities they observe. They also pointed out that they view the lack of consensus as a strength of CSOs because it reflects the uniqueness, dynamics, and contextual differences at different levels. Additionally, they emphasized that the absence of consensus reflects democracy and acknowledges the different perspectives held by MSG members.

The Chair emphasized the importance of respecting diverse opinions and perspectives within the PH- EITI. They mentioned considering providing feedback on Bantay Kita's final report on civic space, so that the assessors can take it into account.

VI. OTHER MATTERS

1. MSG TOR and Internal Rules

The Secretariat is directed to circulate the Terms of Reference (TORs) and Internal Rules through email.

2. 2024 MSG Capacity Building and 89th MSG

The Secretariat outlined the upcoming schedule for the next MSG meetings and activities.

- Day 1: March 19 : Retreat and Capacity Building
- Day 2: March 20 : Retreat and Capacity Building and the 89th MSG Meeting
- Day 3: March 21 : EITI Mission Targeted Assessment Stakeholder Consultations

3. Committee updates

The Secretariat provided updates on committee chairmanship, meeting conduct, and reporting procedures at each MSG session.

VII. SUMMARY OF AGREEMENTS

AGREEMENTS	IN- CHARGE	TIMELINE
------------	------------	----------

<p>The MSG agreed to provide comments on the minutes of the 87th meeting within five days. If no comments are received, the minutes will be deemed approved.</p>	<p>MSG, Secretariat</p>	<p>February 23, 2024</p>
<p>The MSG agreed to refer to the GOC the discussion on the improvement of the feedback mechanism, including the timeline for the processing of cases.</p>	<p>GOC, Secretariat</p>	
<p>The Secretariat to complete the reconciliation process by the end of February 2024, and then present the final report to the Implementation Committee (first week of March) before submitting to EITI International</p>	<p>Secretariat</p>	
<p>The MSG approved the 2024 work plan, subject to change. The Secretariat was instructed to refine the work plan and focus on high-priority activities.</p>	<p>Secretariat</p>	
<p>The Secretariat drafted an MSG statement calling for accountability in relation to the Maco landslide incident, for review and approval of the MSG.</p>	<p>Secretariat</p>	
<p>The Secretariat to assess whether the BARMM initiative is worth pursuing</p>	<p>Secretariat</p>	
<p>In relation to the Civic Space Report, BK to provide a matrix outlining comments received and the ways these were addressed</p>	<p>BK, BK consultant</p>	
<p>The Secretariat to recirculate to the MSG the MSG TOR and Internal Rules for comments and approval.</p>	<p>MSG, Secretariat</p>	

VIII. Adjournment

With no other matters to be discussed, the meeting was adjourned at 12 nn.